Location: Crossroads Barn, Sour Lane, Stirton-with-Thorlb
PROPOSAL: full planning permission for change of use of land to residential curtilage and material amendments to previous planning approval (C/65/601A) part retrospective

LOCATION: Crossroads Barn, Sour Lane, Stirton-with-Thorby

CONSULTEES

Stirton-with-Thorby PM
The Parish Council objects to the retrospective nature of the application, to the raising of the roof, the removal of quoins and repositioning of windows. The full letter is available for Members to view on the Extranet. Further response to amended plans received on the 31/5/2016: support the repositioning of the first floor window shown on the East View. Concerns raised about ensuring the reinstatement of quoin stones and acknowledging the visual benefits of the landscaping works proposed in the revised scheme (also available on the Extranet).

Highways North Yorkshire
No objection, subject to planning conditions regarding the layout and construction of the site access.

Trees & Woodlands
No response received.

Stirton Water Trust
No response received.

CEHO - Craven
No response received.

Upper and Middle Stirton Water Association
No response received.

Yorkshire Dales Society
No response received.

Chief Technical Officer
Under the Private Water Supplies Regulations 2009 the property would require a suitable and sufficient microbiological treatment system i.e. pre-filter and ultra violet installing at point of entry into the property. This will require regular visual checks, and routine maintenance (annual bulb change, cleaning of quartz sleeve and changing of filters as required). Records of
PUBLIC RESPONSES

None to date.

RELEVANT PLANNING POLICIES

HDP3 - Change of use of non-residential buildings to housing
B14(06) - Extensions and Alterations to Buildings
B15(06) - Conversion of Traditional Buildings
GP1(06) - National Park Purposes
GP2(06) - General Design Policy
NE7(06) - Protection of Species

OFFICER OBSERVATIONS

REASON FOR COMMITTEE CONSIDERATION
This application is reported to the Planning Committee as the recommendation of Stirton-with-Thorlby Parish Meeting is contrary to the decision which the Head of Development Management proposes to take and Members of the Planning Committee have previously considered the site at the meeting held on the 9th February 2016.

APPLICATION SITE
The application relates to Crossroads Barn which is positioned at the junction of Bog Lane, Sour Lane and Stirton Lane in the centre of Stirton. Opposite the site is Cock Hill a detached dwelling. A newly converted barn lies at the opposite side of the cross-roads. Stirton Lane and Bog Lane form the National Park boundary. A culverted beck runs under the eastern side of the site. The barn is in the process of being converted into a residential dwelling.

PROPOSAL
The proposal is part-retrospective and is for the conversion of Crossroads Barn to create a 3 bedroom dwelling. Works to extend and convert the barn have commenced and are nearing completion. The proposal includes alterations to the current land levels around the building, the re-positioning of a window, erection of curtilage walls and surfacing.

The proposed accommodation would provide three bedrooms and two en-suites on the first floor with a kitchen, lounge, dining room and study on the ground floor. The application includes all surface treatments for the parking and garden areas, as well as the remainder of the building’s curtilage.

PLANNING HISTORY
The submission follows the partial conversion of Crossroads Barn following an earlier permission (ref. C/65/601C) granted subject to conditions and the completion of a Section 106 ‘local occupancy’ legal agreement in 2013. Planning permission has also been granted in 2014 for the erection of a double garage (ref. C/65/601B) which has since been constructed.

KEY ISSUES
- Principle of development
- Impact upon the character and appearance of area
- Impact of conversion works
- Parish Council comments
- Impact on residential amenity

**PRINCIPLE OF DEVELOPMENT**

In February 2016 a planning enforcement report was brought before Members concerning unauthorised works to convert Crossroads Barn in Stirton-with-Thorlby. The applicant had in seeking to implement the permission carried out works not in accordance with the approved plans. The current application has been submitted in an attempt to rectify the situation.

The conversion of Crossroads Barn, Stirton, to a local occupancy dwelling is acceptable in principle in accordance with policy HDP3 (Change of use of non residential buildings to houses) of the Housing Development Plan 2012 – 2025 and the conversion has previously benefited from full planning permission. The applicant’s failure to adhere to the approved plans rendered this permission obsolete. The works undertaken beyond those granted planning permission are considered to harm the character and appearance of the traditional building, with specific regard to:

- The insertion of a window across an historic building line forming a later addition to the southern elevation,
- The raising of the building roof eaves throughout, by varying amounts;
- The lowering of ground levels around the building;
- The impact on the setting of the building of altering ground levels and providing extensive hard surfacing.

Whilst the conversion of the redundant agricultural building is acceptable in principle, the insensitive approach to conversion was considered to be harmful to the character and appearance of the building and contrary to local plan policies relating to the conversion of traditional buildings, namely Policy B15 of the adopted Yorkshire Dales Local Plan (2006).

**IMPACT UPON CHARACTER AND APPEARANCE OF AREA**

Crossroads Barn is an attractive former agricultural building positioned close to the centre of the hamlet of Stirton, in a location that is publicly prominent. A study of the historic mapping of Stirton shows that, when the building was in agricultural use, it had a small enclosure to the east and was otherwise within an open setting relating primarily to agricultural land to the north.

Whilst the conversion of traditional buildings will inevitably impact upon their setting and appearance, it is imperative that the extent of change should not significantly alter their character. In granting full planning consent in 2013 for the conversion of Crossroads Barn, the Authority agreed that the building was capable of sensitive conversion to a dwelling.

Since the submission of the current application it has been amended to address concerns raised by Officers and Members at the February 2016 Planning Committee meeting. The revised proposals are at the time of writing subject to further public consultation and include:

- the repositioning of an east gable window and reinstatement of quoin stones, meaning the distinct phases of building development remain apparent;
Schedule No: 1

- the re-grading of land levels, to reinstate a more natural gradient throughout the site more appropriate to the setting of the building;
- a reduction in hard surfacing within the curtilage to a relatively discreet area to the north east of the building and a larger parking area to the east;
- provision of low screening walls to screen bins and the immediate building curtilage.

The alterations to the east elevation gable window that was inserted without consent affect an important and publicly prominent elevation of the building. The window inserted overlays the building quoins that separate the principal barn and a lean-to. The stone work either side of the straight join is of two clearly distinct styles with protruding through stones to the principal barn and a random pattern to the stone work. By contrast the later lean-to consists of coursed walling with more regular stonework and joints. The prominent large quoins remain an important part of the building’s character and their removal from the upper part of the wall has had an adverse impact upon the building. The revised scheme satisfactorily reinstates the former building line and quoins, in doing so addressing the harm caused to the appearance of the building.

The amended proposal also includes a more gradual grading of land levels across the site, from north to south. This would remove a recently formed terrace created in part by excavated soil and would mean there is a more continuous gradient that relates to off site land levels to the north. In addition, the applicant has shown how the ground levels surrounding the barn would be reinstated following the completion of works. The western portion of the building remains partly constructed into the surrounding land level. The reinstatement of the earlier ground level would restore some of the building’s earlier character, which included a forking hole in the western gable that would have been more easily accessible on this elevation due to the ground level being approximately 0.7 metre higher than the east gable.

Other details relating to the conversion of the building, including the final finishes to be applied, materials, hard surfacing and layout of the curtilage and boundary walls can be controlled through the use of planning conditions.

IMPACT OF CONVERSION WORKS
In carrying out the conversion works the applicant removed the roof covering to overhaul the roof structure, before reinstating the roof. Following the removal of the roof, the upper courses of the building were ‘made good’. This has clearly affected the northern elevation, with a course of regular stone blocks that are visually distinct from the original stonework. In addition the southern elevation lean-to roof eaves height has been raised by between 30 -40 centimetres. This is because the roof pitch was altered, to form a slope connecting and unbroken with the principal building roof (previously the lean-to had formed a separate lower roof).

Investigations have shown that the roof and wall junction of the main barn has been ‘made good’, with new or re-ordered stonework used to provide a crisp abutment between the roof and wall tops. This has marginally raised the roof and resulted in the roof having a moderate ‘kick’ at the eaves. With regard to the lean-to, the raising of the eaves height appears greater and is publicly visible as a result of being immediately beside the road. However as a smaller and secondary element of the building, it does not have a significant impact on its overall character.

PARISH COUNCIL COMMENTS
The Parish Council has no objection to the conversion of the building to a dwelling but does
object to the raising of the building roof, the removal of quoin stones and the repositioning of windows from their approved position. The structural stability of the building and the retrospective nature of the application are also raised as matters of concern.

The Parish Council is concerned that the unauthorised works conflict with adopted policy relating to the conversion of traditional buildings. These matters are relevant and are addressed above.

The applicant has also provided further information, to confirm the reinstatement of building quoins, confirm the height of boundary walls and detail the extent of landscaping within the site. The re-positioning of the east elevation first floor window and building quoins can be secured by planning condition, to ensure the harm caused by unauthorised works is addressed.

IMPACT ON RESIDENTIAL AMENITY
The proposed conversion does not propose any windows that would cause any direct overlooking of nearby residential properties. The barn lies within the centre of the settlement and is separated from nearby residential properties by the highway. There will be no loss of amenity to neighbouring residents as a result of this proposal.

ANALYSIS AND MATERIAL CONSIDERATIONS
The conversion of Crossroads Barn to a local occupancy restricted dwelling is acceptable in principle, in accordance with the Authority’s adopted housing policies. There are clear benefits from allowing the conversion of a redundant building to provide an additional home within the National Park, in a location that benefits from a vehicular access, utility connections and nearby services.

The extent of conversion works required and the impact of these upon the appearance of the barn are therefore the key relevant issues.

It is regrettable that the applicant has carried out works beyond the earlier permission and in doing so has harmed the character of the building. However, in the scope of this application, Officers have managed to secure a compromise solution that addresses some of the key problems. Members must now consider whether it is expedient to pursue formal enforcement action or accept that the remedial works go far enough to safeguard the essential character of the building and its contribution to the character and appearance of the village.

The amendments to the application and the detailed finishes including the reinstatement of the building quoins can be secured by appropriate planning condition. The proposal is unlikely to have a significant impact on highway safety or residential amenity. On this basis Officers consider that the proposal addresses key areas of concern and the works are not so harmful as to warrant refusal of permission.

It is considered that, subject to the completion of a revised Section 106 agreement to secure 'local need occupancy', the proposed development would comply with policy HDP3 of the Yorkshire Dales National Park Housing Development Plan 2012-2025 and saved policies GP2, B14, B15 and NE7 of the Yorkshire Dales Local Plan (2006) and the guidance provided by the National Planning Policy Framework.

RECOMMENDATION
It is recommended that planning permission is granted subject to conditions and the
completion of a revised Section 106 Agreement to secure the 'local need occupancy' of the dwelling. Any conditions should require the works to be carried out within a short, but reasonable time frame to address the harm caused by the unauthorised works.

Conditions including the following:
- Works in accordance with approved plans,
- East gable window to be re-positioned within 3 months of the date of permission in accordance with submitted details,
- Full details of land levels and landscaping to be agreed and completed,
- Conservation style roof lights, external lighting, surfacing all retained as agreed,
- Highway access layout and surfacing,
- Details of external materials and finishes to be secured by condition including timber windows and doors, retaining roofing materials and stone walling as constructed,
- Provision and retention of bin stores screening,
- No demolition unless shown on approved plans,
- Repair and retention of roadside wall,
- Tree protection,
- Removal or permitted development rights,
- Lintels and cills to match existing,
- Repointing mortar mix,
- Rainwater goods - black and fixed to building.